



## **University of Bradford eThesis**

This thesis is hosted in [Bradford Scholars](#) – The University of Bradford Open Access repository. Visit the repository for full metadata or to contact the repository team



© University of Bradford. This work is licenced for reuse under a [Creative Commons Licence](#).



**Bradford University**  
**School of Management**

# Psychological Health in Companies

*An investigation into the relationships between work characteristics, job roles and psychological health in companies.*

**George Madine**

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Business Administration

April 2009

## Abstract

Keywords: Psychological health, self esteem, job role, worker, manager, self efficacy, education, age, attribution of blame and need for external validation

The research literature contains a significant amount of information on the psychological health of managers, however, relatively little has been written about the psychological health of workers. There has been a long held assumption that there is little difference in the psychological health of workers and managers. This study challenges that assumption and investigates differences in psychological health that appertain to job role and job characteristics determined by job role.

This study tested two related hypotheses, firstly, that ‘managers have significantly better psychological health than workers’; secondly, that ‘that better psychological health was largely due to the increased self esteem that comes from having a more socially desirable role’. Initial analyses of the data indicated that hypothesis 1 was upheld, but when split by sex hypothesis 1 was only upheld for females and not males; similarly hypothesis 2 was only upheld for females. This result was attributed to the influence of two variables, the ‘attribution of blame’ and ‘need for external validation’, and the different moderator and mediator roles they play for males and females.

The study contradicts the assertion that the psychological health of workers and managers is similar, if not the same, and uses the differences found to explain why

research in this field has often produced conflicting results. Areas of potential future research are indicated.

## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor Professor Alistair Ostell for his wisdom and guidance without whom I could not have completed this study; the Director of DBA Studies Dr Nancy Harding and Dr Eva Niemann for their moral support and encouragement when I lost sight of the light at the end of the tunnel and my long suffering partner Sarah, who is an amazing sounding board, untiringly listened to theory after theory, whilst never failing to smile.

Thank you.

# Table of Contents

Title page	
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iv
List of tables	xii
List of figures	xvi
List of contents	v

## CHAPTER 1 - Introduction and Background to the Research

1.0	Goals of the research	1
1.1	Justification of the Research	2
1.2	Gaps in Existing Research	2
1.3	Importance of the Research	3
1.4	Intended Contribution to the Literature	3
1.5	Intended Theoretical Contributions	4
1.6	Intended Managerial Contributions	4
1.7	The Research Problem and Hypotheses	5
1.8	The Scope of the Research	6
1.9	Structure of the thesis	6
1.10	Chapter Summary	9

## CHAPTER 2 - Literature review

2.0	Introduction and Structure of the Literature Review	10
2.1	The problem of definition	11
2.2	Why the literature is heavily slanted towards managers	13
2.3	A changing workforce	14
2.4	A changing view of Psychological Health	17
2.5	Interactional and transactional views of psychological health	18
2.6	The role of perception	20
2.7	Socialisation and culture	21
2.8	The role of personality traits	24
2.9	Mediators, moderators and attributional style	26
2.9.1	<i>Moderating and mediating effects</i>	27
2.9.2	<i>Attributional style</i>	28
2.10	By measuring it, we alter it	30
2.11	Do academic concepts and theories for managers translate to the 'shop floor'?	30
2.12	Models	33
2.13	Chapter summary	34

## CHAPTER 3 - Psychological health

3.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	36
3.1	Definition of Psychological Health	37
3.2	Broad or nonspecific definitions	37
3.3	Definitions describing psychological health as an attribution of symptom (or lack of symptoms)	38
3.4	Definitions describing psychological health as an outcome of a variety of traits	39
3.5	Psychological Health as an Outcome of a person's transactions with the world	40
3.6	Definitions of Psychological health used in this study	40
3.7	The stability of psychological health	41
3.8	The home - work interface	42
3.9	Gender	43
3.10	Chapter Summary	43

## CHAPTER 4 - Self Esteem

4.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	44
4.1	Definition of Self Esteem	45
4.2	Work related self esteem	46
4.3	Social status	46
4.4	Collective self esteem	48
4.5	The link between self esteem and psychological health	50
4.6	Self Efficacy	50
4.7	The stability of self esteem	51
4.8	Chapter summary	53

## CHAPTER 5 - Other variables

5.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	55
5.1	Control	56
5.1.1	<i>Perceived Control</i>	56
5.1.2	<i>Control as a buffer of job stress</i>	56
5.1.3	<i>Control by 'irrelevant means'</i>	57
5.2	Blame and validation	58
5.3	Social Class	59
5.4	Social forces that affect job role	61
5.5	Education	62
5.6	Work life balance	64
5.7	Chapter summary	64

## CHAPTER 6 - Definition of managers and workers

6.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	66
6.1	Definition of managers and workers	67
6.1.1	<i>Nomenclature</i>	67

6.1.2	<i>Managerial workers</i>	68
6.1.3	<i>Non-managerial workers</i>	68
6.2	Official attempts to define the roles	70
6.3	The Changing Nature of Blue-Collar Work	71
6.4	Key factors differentiating the roles in the literature	73
6.5	The management - non-management continuum	74
6.6	Chapter Summary	82

## CHAPTER 7 - Conceptual model and hypotheses

7.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	84
7.1	Chapter theme	85
7.2	Relationship of job role, self esteem and psychological health	86
7.3	Self concept and multicollinearity	87
7.4	Temporal effect on self esteem	88
7.5	Effect of differences in self esteem, perceived self efficacy and perceived competence on behaviour	89
7.6	Effect of differences in control	90
7.7	Education	91
7.8	The classification of worker and manager	93
7.9	Culture	95
7.10	Gender	96
7.10.1	<i>Pressure from home</i>	98
7.11	Conceptual model	98
7.12	Hypotheses	101
7.13	Chapter Summary	101

## CHAPTER 8 - Study design

8.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	103
8.1	Research Paradigms	104
8.1.1	<i>Positivist Approaches</i>	104
8.1.2	<i>Relativist Approaches</i>	106
8.2	Relative strengths and weaknesses of the two approaches	108
8.3	Combining Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches	110
8.4	The Selected Research Methodology	111
8.5	Data Source	114
8.6	Sampling Frame	114
8.6.1	<i>The sampling unit</i>	114
8.6.2	<i>Sample population</i>	115
8.6.3	<i>Sampling frame</i>	115
8.7	Sample Size	116
8.7.1	<i>'Rules of thumb'</i>	117
8.7.2	<i>Sample size calculations</i>	117
8.7.3	<i>Generalisability</i>	120

8.7.4	<i>Desired sample size</i>	120
8.8	Sampling Procedure	120
8.9	Chapter summary	121

## CHAPTER 9 - The survey design and sample

9.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	122
9.1	Overview of the survey design	124
9.2	Phase 1 – Initial Qualitative Study	125
9.2.1	<i>Sample</i>	125
9.2.2	<i>Aim of phase 1</i>	126
9.2.3	<i>Recording of interviews</i>	126
9.2.4	<i>Results of phase 1</i>	126
9.3	Phase 2 – First fact finding quantitative study	129
9.3.1	<i>Format of phase 2</i>	129
9.3.2	<i>Key concepts investigated</i>	129
9.3.3	<i>Questionnaire design</i>	130
9.3.4	<i>Sample</i>	131
9.3.5	<i>Administration of the questionnaire</i>	131
9.3.6	<i>Results of phase 2</i>	132
9.3.7	<i>Decisions based on the results of phase 2</i>	134
9.3.8	<i>Conclusions from phase 2</i>	136
9.4	Phase 3 -The main quantitative study	137
9.4.1	<i>Aim of phase 3</i>	137
9.4.2	<i>Parameters of the instrument used in phase 3</i>	138
9.4.3	<i>Construction of the questionnaire</i>	139
9.4.4	<i>Overview of the sample</i>	139
9.4.5	<i>Problems with shop floor workers</i>	140
9.4.6	<i>Collection of the completed questionnaire</i>	142
9.4.7	<i>The treatment of missing data</i>	142
9.4.8	<i>The Sample</i>	146
9.5	Post hoc issues	157
9.6	Chapter summary	158

## CHAPTER 10 - Phase 3 Questionnaire design

10.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	160
10.1	The aim of the questionnaire	162
10.2	Key components of the main quantitative instrument	163
10.3	Job role	163
10.4	Self esteem	164
10.5	Collective Self-Esteem Scale	165
10.6	Psychological health	166
10.7	Age	168
10.8	Perceived Control	169

10.9	Other aspects of self concept than self esteem	170
10.10	Gender	171
10.11	Education	172
10.12	Behaviours contingent on self esteem or psychological health	174
10.13	Scoring	175
10.14	Confidentiality statement	175
10.15	Use of examples in the questionnaire	176
10.16	Use of the embedded instruments in their original formats	176
10.17	Clarification interviews	177
10.18	Chapter summary	177

## CHAPTER 11 - Statistical analysis

11.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	179
11.1	Statistical significance	180
11.2	Statistical tools used	181
11.3	Multivariate Data Analysis Assumptions	182
11.3.1	<i>Linearity</i>	183
11.3.2	<i>Homoscedasticity</i>	184
11.3.3	<i>Normality</i>	185
11.3.4	<i>Multicollinearity</i>	187
11.4	Reliability and validity	188
11.4.1	<i>Reliability</i>	188
11.4.2	<i>Validity</i>	189
11.5	Chapter summary	192

## CHAPTER 12 - Results – Deriving the Empirical Model

12.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	194
12.1	Setting the scene	196
12.1.1	<i>Scoring methods used for the GHQ</i>	196
12.1.2	<i>Results of comparative studies</i>	198
12.1.3	<i>Advantages and disadvantages of the different scoring methods</i>	200
12.2	Correlation of job role with psychological health	201
12.3	Deriving the empirical model	202
12.3.1	<i>The relationship of job role – self esteem – psychological health</i>	203
12.3.2	<i>Age</i>	205
12.3.3	<i>Control</i>	208
12.3.4	<i>Self Concept</i>	211
12.3.5	<i>Education</i>	215
12.3.6	<i>Gender</i>	216
12.3.7	<i>Behaviours</i>	218
12.3.8	<i>Pressure from home</i>	221
12.4	Empirical model	225
12.5	Chapter summary	227

## CHAPTER 13 - Results – Regression Analysis

13.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	229
13.1	Regression analysis	231
13.2	Key variable selection in hierarchical regression analysis	232
13.2.1	<i>Summary of variables used in the hierarchical analyses</i>	234
13.3	Predictors of psychological health	236
13.3.1	<i>Model Summary</i>	237
13.3.2	<i>ANOVA</i>	238
13.3.3	<i>Standardised coefficients (Betas)</i>	239
13.3.4	<i>Summary of results from the regression analysis</i>	240
13.3.5	<i>Conclusion from regression analysis</i>	241
13.4	Establishing whether increased self esteem is directly due to job role	241
13.4.1	<i>The relationship of job role and self esteem</i>	242
13.4.2	<i>Direct and indirect influences on self esteem</i>	244
13.5	The role of blame and validation	245
13.6	Age	254
13.6.1	<i>Age and job role</i>	257
13.6.2	<i>Hypothesis 2</i>	258
13.6.3	<i>Hypothesis 2 and sex</i>	258
13.6.4	<i>Job role progression and sex</i>	260
13.7	Chapter summary	262

## CHAPTER 14 - Discussion

14.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	264
14.1	Overview of the thesis	266
14.1.1	<i>Aim of the study</i>	266
14.1.2	<i>Structure</i>	267
14.2	Thesis design	268
14.2.1	<i>Phase 1</i>	268
14.2.2	<i>Phase 2</i>	269
14.2.3	<i>Phase 3</i>	269
14.3	Definition of managers and workers	272
14.4	Self esteem and psychological health	273
14.4.1	<i>Self esteem</i>	274
14.4.2	<i>Psychological health</i>	275
14.4.3	<i>Causality</i>	277
14.5	Cultural variation	277
14.6	Hypotheses	279
14.7	Does job role determine self esteem or does self esteem determine job role?	281
14.8	Why the hypotheses are only upheld for females	283

14.9	Why results in this field have been conflicting	285
14.10	Behavioural aspects of the job role – self esteem – psychological health equation	288
14.11	Control	290
14.12	Home / work interface	292
14.13	Education	293
14.14	Chapter Summary	296

## CHAPTER 15 - Conclusions and implications

15.0	Introduction and Structure of the Chapter	298
15.1	Contribution to literature	298
15.2	Theoretical Contributions	300
15.3	Contribution to Management	301
15.4	Implications	302
15.5	Conclusions	303

	Appendix 1	306
	Appendix 2	310
	Appendix 3	329
	Appendix 4	334
	Bibliography	335

## List of tables

Table 1.1:	Overview of chapter one	1
Table 2.1:	Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter two	10
Table 3.1:	Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter three	36
Table 4.1:	Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter four	44
Table 5.1:	Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter five	55
Table 6.1:	Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter six	67
Table 7.1:	Overview of chapter seven	85
Table 7.2:	Summary of interconnection of variables as depicted in figure 7.1	100
Table 8.1:	Overview of chapter eight	103
Table 8.2:	The key assumptions of positivism (Robson, 2002, p. 20)	106
Table 8.3:	Features of relativistic approaches (Fletcher, 1996, p. 414)	108
Table 8.4:	Comparison of strength and weaknesses of both paradigms	109
Table 8.5:	The decision making process when choosing this combined methodology approach	113
Table 8.6:	Definition of the variables in power analysis (Cohen, 1992 p. 156)	119
Table 9.1:	Overview of chapter nine	123
Table 9.2:	Summary of the principal information derived from the first qualitative phase	128
Table 9.3:	The key concepts investigated in the second phase questionnaire	130
Table 9.4:	Breakdown of respondents by industry	131
Table 9.5:	Number of respondents who ‘understood’ the concepts of stress, control, responsibility, accountability and competence	133
Table 9.6:	The Likert scale	134
Table 9.7:	Correlation analysis of five personality variables with job role (Cherniss 1980)	135
Table 9.8:	Key components of the main quantitative instrument	138
Table 9.9:	Analysis of the missing data	143
Table 9.10:	Missing value analysis for education rating by job role	145
Table 9.11:	Missing value analysis for education rating by sex	145
Table 9.12:	Missing value analysis for education rating by job role and sex	146
Table 9.13:	The distribution of the sample between the categories of traditional worker, modern worker, modern manager and traditional manager	147
Table 9.14:	Age distribution of respondents	148
Table 9.15:	Sex distribution of respondents	149
Table 9.16:	Distribution of office, non-office and laboratory staff	149
Table 9.17:	Breakdown of respondents between factory and non-factory	150
Table 9.18:	Number of respondents from the Public and Private sectors	150

Table 9.19:	Distribution of respondent's nationalities	150
Table 9.20:	Mean educational rating	152
Table 9.21:	Mean educational rating split by job role	152
Table 9.21a:	Mean educational rating split by job role and sex	152
Table 9.22:	The sex distribution of the respondents according to job role	153
Table 9.23:	Age distribution of the respondents according to job role	154
Table 9.24:	Distribution of the job roles according to whether the respondents work in a factory or non-factory environment	155
Table 9.25:	Distribution of the job roles according to Public or Private sector	156
Table 10.1:	Overview of chapter ten	161
Table 10.2:	Summary of key variables that the main instrument needed to measure	163
Table 10.3:	Examples of the point scoring system used for education rating	173
Table 10.4:	Correlation of education rating with self esteem	174
Table 11.1:	Overview of chapter eleven	180
Table 11.2:	Elements of reliability and validity (adapted from Seddoh, 2007)	191
Table 11.3:	Examples of reliability and validation results found in the literature for the main instruments used in the phase 3 questionnaire	192
Table 12.1:	Overview of chapter twelve	195
Table 12.2:	Studies utilizing GHQ-12 assessing mental health differences between males and females in different fields of work	198
Table 12.3:	Mean GHQ score for each job role split by sex using the Likert scoring method	200
Table 12.4:	Bivariate correlation analysis of job role with psychological health	202
Table 12.5:	Bivariate correlation analysis of job role with psychological health split for sex	202
Table 12.6:	Bivariate correlation between job role, self esteem and psychological health	203
Table 12.7:	Partial correlation of job role with self esteem removing the effect of psychological health	204
Table 12.8:	Partial correlation of job role with psychological health with the effect of self esteem removed	204
Table 12.9:	Partial correlation of self esteem with psychological health with the effect of job role removed	205
Table 12.10:	Bivariate correlation of age with job role, self esteem and psychological health	206
Table 12.11:	Partial correlation of age with job role with the effects of self esteem and psychological health removed	206
Table 12.12:	Partial correlation of age with self esteem with the effects of job role and psychological health removed	207
Table 12.13:	Partial correlation of age with psychological health with the	

	effects of job role and self esteem removed	207
Table 12.14:	Bivariate correlation of ‘the ability to determine one’s work’ and ‘ability to determine how to do that work’ with job role, self esteem and psychological health	209
Table 12.15:	Partial correlation of determinework31 and howwork32 with job role with the effects of self esteem and psychological health removed	210
Table 12.16:	Partial correlation of determinework31 and howwork32 with self esteem with the effects of job role and psychological health removed	210
Table 12.17:	Partial correlation of determinework31 and howwork32 with psychological health with the effects of job role and self esteem removed	211
Table 12.18:	Bivariate correlation of perceived self efficacy (GSE) and collective self esteem (collectSE) with job role, self esteem and psychological health	212
Table 12.19:	Partial correlation of job role with both self concept variables with the effects of self esteem and psychological health removed	213
Table 12.20:	Partial correlation of self esteem with both self concept variables with the effects of job role and psychological health removed	213
Table 12.21:	Partial correlation of psychological health with both self concept variables with the effects of job role and self esteem removed	214
Table 12.22:	Summary of the partial correlation results of the self concept variables	214
Table 12.23:	Bivariate correlation of education with job role, self esteem and psychological health	215
Table 12.23a:	Independent samples t – test for differences in perception that experience is more important than qualifications of males and females split by job role	216
Table 12.24:	Bivariate correlation of sex with job role, self esteem and psychological health	216
Table 12.25:	Partial correlation of sex with self esteem allowing for psychological health	217
Table 12.26:	Partial correlation of sex with psychological health allowing for self esteem	217
Table 12.27:	Bivariate correlation of sex with ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’	218
Table 12.28:	Bivariate correlation analysis of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’ with job role, self esteem and psychological health	219
Table 12.29:	Summary of bivariate analysis	219

Table 12.30:	Partial correlation of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ with job role excluding the effects of self esteem and psychological health	220
Table 12.31:	Partial correlation of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’ with self esteem excluding the effects of job role and psychological health	220
Table 12.32:	Partial correlation of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’ with psychological health excluding the effects of job role and self esteem	220
Table 12.33:	Bivariate correlation analysis for ‘pressurehome’ with job role, self esteem and psychological health	222
Table 12.34:	Partial correlation of ‘pressurehome’ with job role excluding the effects of self esteem and psychological health	222
Table 12.35:	Partial correlation of ‘pressurehome’ with self esteem excluding the effects of job role and psychological health	223
Table 12.36:	Partial correlation of ‘pressurehome’ with psychological health excluding the effects of job role and self esteem	223
Table 12.37:	Bivariate correlation analysis of pressurehome with sex	224
Table 12.38:	Bivariate correlation analysis of pressurehome with sex split by age	225
Table 13.1:	Overview of chapter thirteen	230
Table 13.2:	Bivariate correlation between self esteem (Rosenberg) and perceived efficacy (GSE)	233
Table 13.3:	Variables used in the hierarchical analyses	235
Table 13.4:	Model summary	237
Table 13.5:	The statistical significance of the models	238
Table 13.6:	The standardized regression coefficients (Betas) for each variable	239
Table 13.7:	Summary of results from the regression analysis	240
Table 13.8:	Mean values of self esteem for the various job roles split by sex	242
Table 13.8a:	Bivariate correlation of job role with self esteem split by sex	243
Table 13.9:	Bivariate correlation analysis to determine the correlation of blame and validation with job role, self esteem and psychological health	246
Table 13.10:	Bivariate correlation analysis to determine the correlation of blame and validation with job role, self esteem and psychological health split for sex	247
Table 13.11:	Partial correlation analysis of blame and validation with self esteem allowing for the effects of psychological health	248
Table 13.12:	Partial correlation analysis of blame and validation with psychological health allowing for the effects of psychological health self esteem	248
Table 13.13:	Partial correlation analysis of job role, self esteem and psychological removing the effect of blame and validation	250
Table 13.14:	Partial correlation analysis of job role, self esteem and	

	psychological removing the effect of blame	251
Table 13.15:	Partial correlation analysis of job role, self esteem and psychological removing the effect of validation	252
Table 13.16:	Mean age of the job roles split by sex	254
Table 13.17:	Bivariate correlation of age with blame and validation split by sex	255
Table 13.18:	Bivariate correlation of age with self esteem	259
Table 13.19:	Relative number of respondents in a given job role for a given age, split by sex	260
Table 13.20:	Chi squared analysis of relative number of respondents in a given job role for a given age, split by sex	261
Table 14.1:	Overview of chapter fourteen	265
Table 15.1:	Overview of chapter fifteen	298

## List of figures

Figure 1.1:	Thesis structure	8
Figure 6.2:	An alternative model to the manager - non-manager Continuum	75
Figure 6.3:	Official attempts to define managers and workers based on the American ISCO and British Standard Occupational classification	77
Figure 6.4:	Definitions of a managerial role by the Committee on Techniques for the Enhancement of Human Performance (1999)	79
Figure 7.1:	A conceptual model of factors impacting on the relationship of job role, self esteem and psychological health	99
Figure 11.1:	The scatter plot generated by plotting ZRESID and ZPRED	184
Figure 11.2:	The scatter plot generated by plotting ZRESID and ZPRED with the line of best fit	186
Figure 11.3:	Histogram of residuals	186
Figure 11.4:	Normal probability plot	187
Figure 12.1:	The mean GHQ score for each job role split by sex	201
Figure 12.2:	Empirical model	226
Figure 13.1:	The relationship of job role with self esteem split by sex	243
Figure 13.2:	The relationship of blame and validation to job role, self esteem and psychological health in females	249
Figure 13.3:	The relationship of blame and validation to job role, self esteem and psychological in males and females	253
Figure 13.4:	Change in self blame with age from Madine (2008)	256
Figure 13.5:	Change in need for external validation with age from Madine (2008)	257
Figure 13.6:	The relationship of age with self esteem	259