Bradford University
School of Management

Psychological Health in Companies

An investigation into the relationships between work characteristics, job roles and psychological health in companies.

George Madine

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Business Administration

April 2009
Abstract

Keywords: Psychological health, self esteem, job role, worker, manager, self efficacy, education, age, attribution of blame and need for external validation

The research literature contains a significant amount of information on the psychological health of managers, however, relatively little has been written about the psychological health of workers. There has been a long held assumption that there is little difference in the psychological health of workers and managers. This study challenges that assumption and investigates differences in psychological health that appertain to job role and job characteristics determined by job role.

This study tested two related hypotheses, firstly, that ‘managers have significantly better psychological health than workers’; secondly, that ‘that better psychological health was largely due to the increased self esteem that comes from having a more socially desirable role’. Initial analyses of the data indicated that hypothesis 1 was upheld, but when split by sex hypothesis 1 was only upheld for females and not males; similarly hypothesis 2 was only upheld for females. This result was attributed to the influence of two variables, the ‘attribution of blame’ and ‘need for external validation’, and the different moderator and mediator roles they play for males and females.

The study contradicts the assertion that the psychological health of workers and managers is similar, if not the same, and uses the differences found to explain why
research in this field has often produced conflicting results. Areas of potential future research are indicated.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor Professor Alistair Ostell for his wisdom and guidance without whom I could not have completed this study; the Director of DBA Studies Dr Nancy Harding and Dr Eva Niemann for their moral support and encouragement when I lost sight of the light at the end of the tunnel and my long suffering partner Sarah, who is an amazing sounding board, untiringly listened to theory after theory, whilst never failing to smile.

Thank you.
# Table of Contents

Title page
Abstract ii
Acknowledgements iv
List of tables xii
List of figures xvi
List of contents v

## CHAPTER 1 - Introduction and Background to the Research

1.0 Goals of the research 1
1.1 Justification of the Research 2
1.2 Gaps in Existing Research 3
1.3 Importance of the Research 3
1.4 Intended Contribution to the Literature 3
1.5 Intended Theoretical Contributions 4
1.6 Intended Managerial Contributions 4
1.7 The Research Problem and Hypotheses 5
1.8 The Scope of the Research 6
1.9 Structure of the thesis 6
1.10 Chapter Summary 9

## CHAPTER 2 - Literature review

2.0 Introduction and Structure of the Literature Review 10
2.1 The problem of definition 11
2.2 Why the literature is heavily slanted towards managers 13
2.3 A changing workforce 14
2.4 A changing view of Psychological Health 17
2.5 Interactional and transactional views of psychological health 18
2.6 The role of perception 20
2.7 Socialisation and culture 21
2.8 The role of personality traits 24
2.9 Mediators, moderators and attributional style 26
2.9.1 Moderating and mediating effects 27
2.9.2 Attributional style 28
2.10 By measuring it, we alter it 30
2.11 Do academic concepts and theories for managers translate to the ‘shop floor’? 30
2.12 Models 33
2.13 Chapter summary 34

## CHAPTER 3 - Psychological health
3.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter 36
3.1 Definition of Psychological Health 37
3.2 Broad or nonspecific definitions 37
3.3 Definitions describing psychological health as an attribution of symptom (or lack of symptoms) 38
3.4 Definitions describing psychological health as an outcome of a variety of traits 39
3.5 Psychological Health as an Outcome of a person’s transactions with the world 40
3.6 Definitions of Psychological health used in this study 40
3.7 The stability of psychological health 41
3.8 The home - work interface 42
3.9 Gender 43
3.10 Chapter Summary 43

CHAPTER 4 - Self Esteem
4.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter 44
4.1 Definition of Self Esteem 45
4.2 Work related self esteem 46
4.3 Social status 46
4.4 Collective self esteem 48
4.5 The link between self esteem and psychological health 50
4.6 Self Efficacy 50
4.7 The stability of self esteem 51
4.8 Chapter summary 53

CHAPTER 5 - Other variables
5.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter 55
5.1 Control 56
5.1.1 Perceived Control 56
5.1.2 Control as a buffer of job stress 56
5.1.3 Control by ‘irrelevant means’ 57
5.2 Blame and validation 58
5.3 Social Class 59
5.4 Social forces that affect job role 61
5.5 Education 62
5.6 Work life balance 64
5.7 Chapter summary 64

CHAPTER 6 - Definition of managers and workers
6.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter 66
6.1 Definition of managers and workers 67
6.1.1 Nomenclature 67
| 6.1.2 | Managerial workers | 68 |
| 6.1.3 | Non-managerial workers | 68 |
| 6.2  | Official attempts to define the roles | 70 |
| 6.3  | The Changing Nature of Blue-Collar Work | 71 |
| 6.4  | Key factors differentiating the roles in the literature | 73 |
| 6.5  | The management - non-management continuum | 74 |
| 6.6  | Chapter Summary | 82 |

CHAPTER 7 - Conceptual model and hypotheses

| 7.0  | Introduction and Structure of the Chapter | 84 |
| 7.1  | Chapter theme | 85 |
| 7.2  | Relationship of job role, self esteem and psychological health | 86 |
| 7.3  | Self concept and multicollinearity | 87 |
| 7.4  | Temporal effect on self esteem | 88 |
| 7.5  | Effect of differences in self esteem, perceived self efficacy and perceived competence on behaviour | 89 |
| 7.6  | Effect of differences in control | 90 |
| 7.7  | Education | 91 |
| 7.8  | The classification of worker and manager | 93 |
| 7.9  | Culture | 95 |
| 7.10 | Gender | 96 |
| 7.10.1 | Pressure from home | 98 |
| 7.11  | Conceptual model | 98 |
| 7.12  | Hypotheses | 101 |
| 7.13  | Chapter Summary | 101 |

CHAPTER 8 - Study design

| 8.0  | Introduction and Structure of the Chapter | 103 |
| 8.1  | Research Paradigms | 104 |
| 8.1.1 | Positivist Approaches | 104 |
| 8.1.2 | Relativist Approaches | 106 |
| 8.2  | Relative strengths and weaknesses of the two approaches | 108 |
| 8.3  | Combining Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches | 110 |
| 8.4  | The Selected Research Methodology | 111 |
| 8.5  | Data Source | 114 |
| 8.6  | Sampling Frame | 114 |
| 8.6.1 | The sampling unit | 114 |
| 8.6.2 | Sample population | 115 |
| 8.6.3 | Sampling frame | 115 |
| 8.7  | Sample Size | 116 |
| 8.7.1 | 'Rules of thumb’ | 117 |
| 8.7.2 | Sample size calculations | 117 |
| 8.7.3 | Generalisability | 120 |
CHAPTER 9 - The survey design and sample

9.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter
9.1 Overview of the survey design
9.2 Phase 1 – Initial Qualitative Study
9.2.1 Sample
9.2.2 Aim of phase 1
9.2.3 Recording of interviews
9.2.4 Results of phase 1
9.3 Phase 2 – First fact finding quantitative study
9.3.1 Format of phase 2
9.3.2 Key concepts investigated
9.3.3 Questionnaire design
9.3.4 Sample
9.3.5 Administration of the questionnaire
9.3.6 Results of phase 2
9.3.7 Decisions based on the results of phase 2
9.3.8 Conclusions from phase 2
9.4 Phase 3 -The main quantitative study
9.4.1 Aim of phase 3
9.4.2 Parameters of the instrument used in phase 3
9.4.3 Construction of the questionnaire
9.4.4 Overview of the sample
9.4.5 Problems with shop floor workers
9.4.6 Collection of the completed questionnaire
9.4.7 The treatment of missing data
9.4.8 The Sample
9.5 Post hoc issues
9.6 Chapter summary

CHAPTER 10 - Phase 3 Questionnaire design
10.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter
10.1 The aim of the questionnaire
10.2 Key components of the main quantitative instrument
10.3 Job role
10.4 Self esteem
10.5 Collective Self-Esteem Scale
10.6 Psychological health
10.7 Age
10.8 Perceived Control
10.9 Other aspects of self concept than self esteem 170
10.10 Gender 171
10.11 Education 172
10.12 Behaviours contingent on self esteem or psychological health 174
10.13 Scoring 175
10.14 Confidentiality statement 175
10.15 Use of examples in the questionnaire 176
10.16 Use of the embedded instruments in their original formats 176
10.17 Clarification interviews 177
10.18 Chapter summary 177

CHAPTER 11 - Statistical analysis
11.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter 179
11.1 Statistical significance 180
11.2 Statistical tools used 181
11.3 Multivariate Data Analysis Assumptions 182
11.3.1 Linearity 183
11.3.2 Homoscedasticity 184
11.3.3 Normality 185
11.3.4 Multicollinearity 187
11.4 Reliability and validity 188
11.4.1 Reliability 188
11.4.2 Validity 189
11.5 Chapter summary 192

CHAPTER 12 - Results – Deriving the Empirical Model
12.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter 194
12.1 Setting the scene 196
12.1.1 Scoring methods used for the GHQ 196
12.1.2 Results of comparative studies 198
12.1.3 Advantages and disadvantages of the different scoring methods 200
12.2 Correlation of job role with psychological health 201
12.3 Deriving the empirical model 202
12.3.1 The relationship of job role – self esteem – psychological health 203
12.3.2 Age 205
12.3.3 Control 208
12.3.4 Self Concept 211
12.3.5 Education 215
12.3.6 Gender 216
12.3.7 Behaviours 218
12.3.8 Pressure from home 221
12.4 Empirical model 225
12.5 Chapter summary 227
14.9 Why results in this field have been conflicting  285
14.10 Behavioural aspects of the job role – self esteem – psychological health equation  288
14.11 Control  290
14.12 Home / work interface  292
14.13 Education  293
14.14 Chapter Summary  296

CHAPTER 15 - Conclusions and implications
15.0 Introduction and Structure of the Chapter  298
15.1 Contribution to literature  298
15.2 Theoretical Contributions  300
15.3 Contribution to Management  301
15.4 Implications  302
15.5 Conclusions  303

Appendix 1  306
Appendix 2  310
Appendix 3  329
Appendix 4  334
Bibliography  335
List of tables

Table 1.1:  Overview of chapter one                         1
Table 2.1:  Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter two             10
Table 3.1:  Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter three             36
Table 4.1:  Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter four             44
Table 5.1:  Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter five             55
Table 6.1:  Overview of the areas of research reviewed in chapter six             67
Table 7.1:  Overview of chapter seven                 85
Table 7.2:  Summary of interconnection of variables as depicted in figure 7.1                 100
Table 8.1:  Overview of chapter eight                         103
Table 8.2:  The key assumptions of positivism (Robson, 2002, p. 20)            106
Table 8.3:  Features of relativistic approaches (Fletcher, 1996, p. 414)            108
Table 8.4:  Comparison of strength and weaknesses of both paradigms           109
Table 8.5:  The decision making process when choosing this combined methodology approach 113
Table 8.6:  Definition of the variables in power analysis (Cohen, 1992 p. 156)                 119
Table 9.1:  Overview of chapter nine                         123
Table 9.2:  Summary of the principal information derived from the first qualitative phase 128
Table 9.3:  The key concepts investigated in the second phase questionnaire 130
Table 9.4:  Breakdown of respondents by industry            131
Table 9.5:  Number of respondents who ‘understood’ the concepts of stress, control, responsibility, accountability and competence 133
Table 9.6:  The Likert scale                                134
Table 9.7:  Correlation analysis of five personality variables with job role (Cherniss 1980)                 135
Table 9.8:  Key components of the main quantitative instrument                         138
Table 9.9:  Analysis of the missing data                         143
Table 9.10:  Missing value analysis for education rating by job role             145
Table 9.11:  Missing value analysis for education rating by sex             145
Table 9.12:  Missing value analysis for education rating by job role and sex             146
Table 9.13:  The distribution of the sample between the categories of traditional worker, modern worker, modern manager and traditional manager 147
Table 9.14:  Age distribution of respondents                              148
Table 9.15:  Sex distribution of respondents                        149
Table 9.16:  Distribution of office, non-office and laboratory staff      149
Table 9.17:  Breakdown of respondents between factory and non-factory   150
Table 9.18:  Number of respondents from the Public and Private sectors   150
| Table 9.19: | Distribution of respondent’s nationalities | 150 |
| Table 9.20: | Mean educational rating | 152 |
| Table 9.21: | Mean educational rating split by job role | 152 |
| Table 9.21a: | Mean educational rating split by job role and sex | 152 |
| Table 9.22: | The sex distribution of the respondents according to job role | 153 |
| Table 9.23: | Age distribution of the respondents according to job role | 154 |
| Table 9.24: | Distribution of the job roles according to whether the respondents work in a factory or non-factory environment | 155 |
| Table 9.25: | Distribution of the job roles according to Public or Private sector | 156 |
| Table 10.1: | Overview of chapter ten | 161 |
| Table 10.2: | Summary of key variables that the main instrument needed to measure | 163 |
| Table 10.3: | Examples of the point scoring system used for education rating | 173 |
| Table 10.4: | Correlation of education rating with self esteem | 174 |
| Table 11.1: | Overview of chapter eleven | 180 |
| Table 11.2: | Elements of reliability and validity (adapted from Seddoh, 2007) | 191 |
| Table 11.3: | Examples of reliability and validation results found in the literature for the main instruments used in the phase 3 questionnaire | 192 |
| Table 12.1: | Overview of chapter twelve | 195 |
| Table 12.2: | Studies utilizing GHQ-12 assessing mental health differences between males and females in different fields of work | 198 |
| Table 12.3: | Mean GHQ score for each job role split by sex using the Likert scoring method | 200 |
| Table 12.4: | Bivariate correlation analysis of job role with psychological health | 202 |
| Table 12.5: | Bivariate correlation analysis of job role with psychological health split for sex | 202 |
| Table 12.6: | Bivariate correlation between job role, self esteem and psychological health | 203 |
| Table 12.7: | Partial correlation of job role with self esteem removing the effect of psychological health | 204 |
| Table 12.8: | Partial correlation of job role with psychological health with the effect of self esteem removed | 204 |
| Table 12.9: | Partial correlation of self esteem with psychological health with the effect of job role removed | 205 |
| Table 12.10: | Bivariate correlation of age with job role, self esteem and psychological health | 206 |
| Table 12.11: | Partial correlation of age with job role with the effects of self esteem and psychological health removed | 206 |
| Table 12.12: | Partial correlation of age with self esteem with the effects of job role and psychological health removed | 207 |
| Table 12.13: | Partial correlation of age with psychological health with the |
Table 12.14: Bivariate correlation of ‘the ability to determine one’s work’ and ‘ability to determine how to do that work’ with job role, self esteem and psychological health

Table 12.15: Partial correlation of determinework31 and howwork32 with job role with the effects of self esteem and psychological health removed

Table 12.16: Partial correlation of determinework31 and howwork32 with self esteem with the effects of job role and psychological health removed

Table 12.17: Partial correlation of determinework31 and howwork32 with psychological health with the effects of job role and self esteem removed

Table 12.18: Bivariate correlation of perceived self efficacy (GSE) and collective self esteem (collectSE) with job role, self esteem and psychological health

Table 12.19: Partial correlation of job role with both self concept variables with the effects of self esteem and psychological health removed

Table 12.20: Partial correlation of self esteem with both self concept variables with the effects of job role and psychological health removed

Table 12.21: Partial correlation of psychological health with both self concept variables with the effects of job role and self esteem removed

Table 12.22: Summary of the partial correlation results of the self concept variables

Table 12.23: Bivariate correlation of education with job role, self esteem and psychological health

Table 12.23a: Independent samples t – test for differences in perception that experience is more important than qualifications of males and females split by job role

Table 12.24: Bivariate correlation of sex with job role, self esteem and psychological health

Table 12.25: Partial correlation of sex with self esteem allowing for psychological health

Table 12.26: Partial correlation of sex with psychological health allowing for self esteem

Table 12.27: Bivariate correlation of sex with ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’

Table 12.28: Bivariate correlation analysis of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’ with job role, self esteem and psychological health

Table 12.29: Summary of bivariate analysis
Table 12.30: Partial correlation of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ with job role excluding the effects of self esteem and psychological health 220

Table 12.31: Partial correlation of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’ with self esteem excluding the effects of job role and psychological health 220

Table 12.32: Partial correlation of ‘doing the minimum they can at work’ and ‘acting a rebel’ with psychological health excluding the effects of job role and self esteem 220

Table 12.33: Bivariate correlation analysis for ‘pressurehome’ with job role, self esteem and psychological health 222

Table 12.34: Partial correlation of ‘pressurehome’ with job role excluding the effects of self esteem and psychological health 222

Table 12.35: Partial correlation of ‘pressurehome’ with self esteem excluding the effects of job role and psychological health 222

Table 12.36: Partial correlation of ‘pressurehome’ with psychological health excluding the effects of job role and self esteem 223

Table 12.37: Bivariate correlation analysis of pressurehome with sex 224

Table 12.38: Bivariate correlation analysis of pressurehome with sex split by age 225

Table 13.1: Overview of chapter thirteen 230

Table 13.2: Bivariate correlation between self esteem (Rosenberg) and perceived efficacy (GSE) 233

Table 13.3: Variables used in the hierarchical analyses 235

Table 13.4: Model summary 237

Table 13.5: The statistical significance of the models 238

Table 13.6: The standardized regression coefficients (Betas) for each variable 239

Table 13.7: Summary of results from the regression analysis 240

Table 13.8: Mean values of self esteem for the various job roles split by sex 242

Table 13.8a: Bivariate correlation of job role with self esteem split by sex 243

Table 13.9: Bivariate correlation analysis to determine the correlation of blame and validation with job role, self esteem and psychological health 246

Table 13.10: Bivariate correlation analysis to determine the correlation of blame and validation with job role, self esteem and psychological health split for sex 247

Table 13.11: Partial correlation analysis of blame and validation with self esteem allowing for the effects of psychological health 248

Table 13.12: Partial correlation analysis of blame and validation with psychological health allowing for the effects of psychological health self esteem 248

Table 13.13: Partial correlation analysis of job role, self esteem and psychological removing the effect of blame and validation 250

Table 13.14: Partial correlation analysis of job role, self esteem and
psychological removing the effect of blame 251
Table 13.15: Partial correlation analysis of job role, self esteem and psychological removing the effect of validation 252
Table 13.16: Mean age of the job roles split by sex 254
Table 13.17: Bivariate correlation of age with blame and validation split by sex 255
Table 13.18: Bivariate correlation of age with self esteem 259
Table 13.19: Relative number of respondents in a given job role for a given age, split by sex 260
Table 13.20: Chi squared analysis of relative number of respondents in a given job role for a given age, split by sex 261
Table 14.1: Overview of chapter fourteen 265
Table 15.1: Overview of chapter fifteen 298
List of figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.1:</td>
<td>Thesis structure</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.2:</td>
<td>An alternative model to the manager - non-manager Continuum</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.3:</td>
<td>Official attempts to define managers and workers based on the American ISCO and British Standard Occupational classification</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.4:</td>
<td>Definitions of a managerial role by the Committee on Techniques for the Enhancement of Human Performance (1999)</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.1:</td>
<td>A conceptual model of factors impacting on the relationship of job role, self esteem and psychological health</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11.1:</td>
<td>The scatter plot generated by plotting ZRESID and ZPRED</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11.2:</td>
<td>The scatter plot generated by plotting ZRESID and ZPRED with the line of best fit</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11.3:</td>
<td>Histogram of residuals</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11.4:</td>
<td>Normal probability plot</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12.1:</td>
<td>The mean GHQ score for each job role split by sex</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 12.2:</td>
<td>Empirical model</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13.1:</td>
<td>The relationship of job role with self esteem split by sex</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13.2:</td>
<td>The relationship of blame and validation to job role, self esteem and psychological health in females</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13.3:</td>
<td>The relationship of blame and validation to job role, self esteem and psychological in males and females</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13.4:</td>
<td>Change in self blame with age from Madine (2008)</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13.5:</td>
<td>Change in need for external validation with age from Madine (2008)</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 13.6:</td>
<td>The relationship of age with self esteem</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>