



Association of Environmental Law Lecturers  
in Middle East and North African Universities  
جمعية محاضري القانون البيئي في جامعات الشرق الأوسط وشمال إفريقيا



GIMPA  
Faculty of Law



SCHOOL OF LAW



Leigh Day



UNESCO Chair on Environmental Law  
and Sustainable Development



## UNIVERSITY OF BRADFORD, SCHOOL OF LAW CONFERENCE 2023

### Just Transition and Environmental Justice: Principles, Practice and Implementation Strategies for a Post-Oil Future (Hybrid)

University of Bradford, Richmond Road, Bradford BD7 1DP

26<sup>th</sup> - 28<sup>th</sup> July 2023



## CONFERENCE REPORT

Editors:

Engobo Emeseh

Pedi Obani

Irekpitan Okukpon

Ovo Imoedemhe

Prince Olokotor

**Table of Contents**

<i>Contents</i>	<i>Pgs</i>
<b>A. General Introduction/Background</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>B. Day One: Summary of Proceedings</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>C. Day Two: Summary of Proceedings</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>D. Day Three: Summary of Proceedings</b>	<b>18</b>
• <b>Seminar Communique</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>Appendix</b>	
<i>Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission Report 2023</i>	<b>25</b>

**A. GENERAL INTRODUCTION/BACKGROUND**

## 1.1 Introduction

The School of Law University of Bradford is a modern law school with a growing research portfolio on various aspects of sustainable development law and policy. We support an active research community which comprises our academics, our students, and external partners, leading on, and collaborating in, world-class research which is academically rigorous, innovative, applicable to real life, can positively influence policy and practice and promote social justice. For this purpose, we collaborate with academic, third sector, professional and industry partners at national and international levels to foster an active research community, social justice and innovative, policy-oriented research.

The term 'just transition' has recently evolved from a process that seeks to galvanize a change in energy production and consumption practices to one which alludes to a transition from a fossil-fuel dependent economy or development approach to a low-carbon economy.

The just transition discourse takes as its point of departure the recognition that fossil-fuel dependent economies were characterised by environmental injustice, inequalities or uneven distribution of environmental resources. Hence, the need to protect vulnerable communities, workers and dependent economic systems so that the adverse impact of the transition to a low-carbon economy will be reduced.

It is imperative that a holistic approach be taken in recognising the inequalities which have arisen for various stakeholders within and between countries that bear the cost of decarbonization, including historical concerns and environmental (in)justice. Therefore, implementing just transition requires an overview of social equality; inclusive participation; distributive justice; policy reform and implementation of judicial and non-judicial mechanisms for access to environmental justice.

Hence, the conference provided a forum to identify diverse pathways for implementing just transition, explore how inequalities arise from these transitions, and highlight effective legal frameworks for access to environmental justice at the international and national levels.

## 1.2 Objective of the Conference

The conference aims to provide key insights on strategies for the implementation of a just transition for all towards realising environmental sustainability at international, regional and national levels. It is also essential for experts and key stakeholders from diverse sectors, including States, non-state actors and the third sector, to come together to deliberate on issues relating to access to justice in addressing social inequalities facilitated by just transitions.

The conference brought together key stakeholders including leading experts from various professions, academia, civil society organisations, technocrats, communities, businesses, regulators, and other stakeholders.

### **1.3 Expected Outcomes**

A communique and guidance documents outlining strategies for implementing just transition and advancing access to environmental justice in a post-oil future, addressed to governments and other stakeholders in the oil and gas, energy and climate governance sectors.

An edited peer-reviewed book of more in-depth contributions by the expert presenters on the conference themes that will be an authoritative and comprehensive resource on international, regional and national perspectives on just transition and environmental justice in a post-oil future.

## **B. DAY ONE: SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS**

### **2.1 OPENING PRELIMINARIES**

The Conference provided an opportunity for online and in-person attendance.

Day One of the Conference commenced with opening remarks/welcome message from the Vice-Chancellor, University of Bradford – Professor Shirley Congdon. Providing an overview of the Conference, the Head, School of Law, Professor Engobo Emeseh also discussed a report of the Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission titled ‘Environmental Genocide: The Human and Environmental Cost of Big Oil in Bayelsa, Nigeria’ The document is an investigative report which highlights the damage to the environment, lives and livelihoods of people in Bayelsa State, Nigeria and the need for accountability of international oil and gas companies (IOCs) for environmental damages which had been recently published. A Representative of the Bayelsa State Government, Nigeria – Ms Funkazi Koroye presented copies of the report to the Vice-chancellor. This report was also discussed as a plenary session during Day 2 of the Conference.

The Dean, Faculty of Management, Law and Social Science – Professor Amir Sharif in his welcome remarks, described just transition as a hyper object as postulated by Tim Morton. He noted the conundrum of individually understanding climate change which is at the scale of the planet, ways to make it more relevant to individuals, and the challenges of how to make just transition accessible, digestible and consumable at global levels, as this is what the Conference seeks to achieve over the next three days.

#### **2.1.1 Conference Keynote Addresses**

The first keynote address of the Conference was made by Professor Gavin Bridge (Durham University). The keynote titled ‘Transition, Justice and the Ever-Present Politics of Climate Delay highlighted the concept of just transition, the evolution of

the concept and interlinkages with environmental justice. He noted that reparation and equity must be considered in rectifying past wrongs which will in turn help just transition, thus relating just transition with environmental justice.

Following this keynote address, questions from the audience to Professor Bridge centred around existing injustice in various developing countries and how the social cost of this can be managed through environmental justice e.g. subsidy removal in Nigeria, effect on farmers, etc; and environmental challenges faced by the people of Bayelsa State. A participant also observed that the concept of just transition implies a solution, but we appear to be far away from solving issues relating to environmental justice.

In responding to these observations and questions, Professor Bridge emphasized that just transitions must be made accessible, digestible and conceivable, with other participants suggesting that professionals from the health, technology, housing and engineering sectors should be included in discussions relating to just transitions.

The second Keynote Address titled 'Reflections on a Just Transition and Environmental Justice in a Post-oil Future' was delivered by Professor Patricia Kameri-Mbote (UNEP).

Professor Mbote noted that the topic of just transition is very timely and significant, especially as the world is currently facing a climate emergency. She emphasized the need to create more circular economies, need to factor gender equity into any just transition discourse; access to sustainable energy; greening the environment and the issue of financing.

Professor Mbote highlighted the challenges faced by environmental courts and tribunals to include lack of independence and lack of enforcement procedures for environmental decisions such as those in climate change cases. Despite these challenges, Professor Mbote noted that UNEP continues to encourage commitment to the advancement of environmental rule of law, environmental governance and related policy issues across the globe.

Whilst citing examples of how the international community and UNEP supports developing countries in the transition to cleaner energies and greener economies, Professor Mbote called for collective action to ensure that future generations inherit a world that is not burdened by the mistakes and injustices of the past. She postulated further that together, we can lay the foundation for a post oil future that is characterised by environmental justice, equality and prosperity for all. By addressing the unique challenges in circumstances of developing countries through tailoring just transition to developing country-specific context, combined with climate finance capacity and policy building, the international community can enable developing nations to advance their climate and social justice goals while ensuring sustainable and inclusive development for all.

Professor Mbote's address concluded with her expressing the confidence that the conference would stimulate intellectual discussions, innovative ideas and transformative collaborations to embark on the journey of discovery and collective action together as we strive towards a sustainable future rooted in justice and equality.

## **2.2 Breakout Sessions**

Presentations by participants were carried out via breakout sessions. Participants returned from a 15-minute health break to the first breakout session of the Conference.

### **2.2.1 Breakout Session 1**

The first presentation titled 'Reconceptualizing Energy Justice from a Corporate Responsibility perspective: Old Body in New Robes' was made by Dr. Godswill Aigbaitoro (University of Essex). His presentation centred around the Implementation of energy justice and how corporate social responsibility (CSR) can be used as a tool to push for energy justice; the need for corporations to act as agents of energy justice to provide energy access, improve the economy; develop communities in order to resolve poverty challenges; and promote distributive energy justice rather than just social amenities.

Recommendations proposed by Dr. Aigbaitoro include push by companies operating in the energy and extractive sectors for distributive justice; fair distribution of access to modern energy systems and services; decentralization of energy options; providing universal access to clean and renewable energy development, sustainable development, transparency and accountability and energy efficiency conservation.

The second presentation titled 'Africa and Just Energy Transition: Achieving Climate Change Mitigation, Social Inclusion, Equality and Environmental Justice in Fossil Fuel Dependent Economy' was delivered by Dr. Obinna Dike (American University of Nigeria).

Dr. Dike's presentation analysed climate change mitigation, noting that climate change mitigation and adaptations would depend on a strong economy, governance, climate financing, enhanced capability of States and its ability to run mitigation, adaptation and resilience strategies. Recommendations emanating from his presentation included the need for States to improve relevant governance institutions and capacity development to ensure climate change/energy transition policies are more consultative and inclusive; and a need for greater cooperation and support on transition technology development and deployment.

Breakout Session did not take place as participants originally slated to make their presentations were unavailable.



### 2.2.2 Plenary Session 1

The first plenary session of the Conference themed 'Natural Resources, Inequalities and Environmental Justice' was chaired by Dr. Isaac Asume Osuoka (Social Action International).

Dr. Osuoka emphasized that the plenary session was a continuation of earlier presentations which centred around natural resources, inequalities and environmental justice, and how much progress has been made in this regards globally.

Speaking to the theme of the plenary session, Professor 'Lanre Fagbohun, SAN (Environmental Law Research Institute) discussed the issues underlying natural resources, the economic necessity and the structural inequalities that are the consistent fallouts of the mining and extraction of these natural resources. He highlighted the rich north that have the finances and technology to utilize the natural resources and the poor south that are the host communities of these natural resources and asked how these can be evenly balanced.

Professor Fagbohun also analysed the ecosystem degradation of the communities, the health implications on the people that inhale such toxins, the loss of cultural values, loss of indigenous rights/knowledge, illicit financing. He further discussed the right of citizens to seek justice through the justice system (the court) and the challenges encountered in that regard such as pre action notice, preliminary objections, issue of *locus standi* and time limitations within which to bring an action on matters relating to environmental law.

### 2.2.3 Breakout Sessions

After Plenary Session 1, participants were notified of the breakout sessions, appropriate meeting rooms and meeting links to sign into to facilitate access to the sessions online.

#### 2.2.3.1 Breakout Session 3

This breakout session was chaired by Dr. Irekpitan Okukpon (University of Bradford) with four presentations made.

The first presentation titled 'Nationally Determined Contributions under the Paris Agreement: Securing Technology Justice for Just Transition' was delivered by Okorite Soibi. Her presentation examined the principle of differentiation and polluter principles in the Paris regime and how they contribute to the present regime. It further examined the effectiveness or otherwise of the present NDC especially in the light of the requirement of consideration of technology transfer, finance requirement and capacity building.

Recommendations from her presentation were as follows: the need to identify the overall gaps within the Paris agreement in terms of implementation; more focus on

driving home the principles of differentiation and Polluter pays principle as this will ensure a lot more progress is made; promotion of the capability approach which focuses on allowing countries to contribute what they can to ensure we are promoting sustainability by making sure that countries that have contributed more or have more resources contribute more to solve the global problem.

The second presentation titled 'Just Socio-Ecological Transition through the Ymuna Rejuvenation Initiative' was delivered by Shivani Singhal (University of Leeds). Her presentation examined socio-ecological transition through the Yamuna rejuvenation initiative driven by specialised courts in India to determine whether they are just, looking at it through political lens.

Ms Singhal highlighted the idea of bourgeoisie environmentalism and the environmentalism of the dispossessed i.e. the marginalised actors. She also noted that the River Yamuna is the most polluted part in India as it suffers pollution from domestic and industrial sewages, especially as such agricultural activities are banned in that area. This thus raised questions as to whether this act of pollution is just.

The third presentation titled 'Human Rights-Based Approach to Energy Transition in Africa: Addressing Social Inequalities and Ensuring Inclusive Development' was delivered by Oyeniyi Abe (University of Huddersfield). His presentation emphasized a human rights (HR) based approach to energy transition as local implementation remains weak. Hence, integrating HR in energy project cannot work where there is no respect for human rights.

He also noted that energy is needed to process and distribute food and water. Despite this, we continue to see a complex failure of domestic systems to ensure a just and equitable distribution and use of energy resources. As such, he emphasized that the crises is that renewable energy is critical in tackling the global chain brought about by climate change and Covid. In addition, access to energy in global south countries is lacking and has prevented millions of citizens especially the vulnerable group - the disabled, the elderly, women, children from access to electricity and other energy services. He concluded the presentation with the admonition that the search for energy transition should not complicate human rights, but rather ensure that everyone who will be affected by this transition takes part in decision making processes.

The fourth presentation titled 'Protection of the Human Rights of IDPs in the Post-oil Transition' was delivered by Olugbenga Falade (University of Hull). His presentation focused on the rights of IDPs as indigenous members of the host communities whose rights are not protected by any treaty, as issues on climate change create disasters which create internally displaced persons.

The paper proffered some recommendations which include: call for a treaty to protect IDPs; IDPs should be part of the post-oil transition; establishment of institutions to protect IDPs and indigenous people.



#### 2.2.3.2 Breakout Session 4

The breakout session, chaired by Associate Professor Pedi Obani, had two presentations.

The first presentation titled 'Obstacles to Realising Justice in the transition to a Transnational Circular Economy in the Post-oil Era' was delivered by Feja Lesniewska (University of Surrey). It discussed the lack of critical research and engagement, how a circular economy will be achieved, and acknowledged a shift from the era of gross injustice and fossil fuel era to gross injustice in the period of the material age.

The presentation emphasized the need for reuse and redesign of critical metals components within vehicles, electric cars, phones etc; the need to reduce recycling because it's very energy intensive, materialistic, and a further acknowledgment that we are transitioning away from fossil fuels, and waste is attractive to be burned and used for energy.

The paper's recommendations include paying more attention to the responsible consumption of modules of circularity; and moving away from outdated theories i.e. a cosmopolitan diversity post-colonial ideas of justice.

The second presentation titled 'Just Transitions in Nigeria: Prospects and Challenges for Resilience and Environmental Justice in Resource Dependent Socio-Ecological Systems' was delivered by Misan Afinotan (University of Exeter). He note that as climate change is an ever-present reality, its mitigation and an improvement in the right of those that are living and working in the fossil-fuel driven economy is imperative.

The paper highlighted the disconnect in climate change laws from the humanity perspective, and the need to acknowledge that there is a wholesale adoption from the western push for just transitions without actually applying it to suit developing traditions and culture to make it more applicable. The paper concluded with the suggestion that existing legal systems need to be resilient to the climate change issues and introduce traditional principles that are grounded in the African culture into climate change frameworks.

#### 2.2.3.3 Breakout Session 5

The breakout session was chaired by Dr. Ovo Catherine Imoedemhe, and had five presentations.

The first presentation titled 'Justice Considerations in the Urban Climate Transition: A Dual Case Study on Belgian LEZ Zones and the Obligation to Renovate and Decarbonise Residential Buildings' was delivered by Florence Van Durme (University of Antwerp, Belgium). Her presentation noted that climate change and environmental pollution is a major global problem which has led to confrontation between sustainable development goal and environmental justice.

The paper recognised that not enough consideration is given to adopting environmental justice in policy, and as such, there is a need to look into the role and relevance of environmental justice principle when different government policy requires citizen contribution and consideration; and also a need for distributive and participatory environmental justice to apply to all irrespective of socio-economic status. The paper recommended that the Belgium government should reduce tariff for residents of LEZ Zones.

The second paper titled 'Just Transitions and Carbon Right Benefit Sharing Arrangements: The role of Community Resource Management Areas in Ghana' was delivered by Clement Kojo Akapame (Ghana Institute of management and Public Administration). The paper highlighted that community resource management are carried out on voluntary bases, based on existing structure at the national level and the need to address the constraint capacity of the people in the community. The paper also emphasized the need for a landscape approach where both the community, government and corporation can work together to ensure current legislation aligns with just transition.

The third paper titled 'Developing Existing Legislation to Reduce Food and Energy Loss in Jordan as a Model for Preserving Natural Resources and Finding Alternative Sources of Energy' was delivered by Omar Al Khataibeh (ASSELLMU). The paper discussed the need for all national governments to have a meeting point to discuss the issue of food reduction.

The fourth paper titled 'The Dilemma of Nascent Petroleum Economies in an Era of Energy Transition: The case of Ghana' was delivered by Humu-Annie Seini (Ghana Institute of management and Public Administration). The paper highlighted the fact that Ghana has ratified the international policies on climate change. However, the climate crisis remains unchanging. The paper emphasized that the energy transition must be progressive and not sudden, and the need for reform in the upstream regulatory framework in Ghana.

The fifth paper titled 'Divestment of Assets by Multinational Corporations in the Oil and Gas Industry: Decommissioning and Environmental Justice to the Host Oil and Gas Producing Communities under the Nigerian Regulatory Regime' was delivered by Ebiemere Osaro (University of Bradford). The paper called for corporate accountability, highlighting the travails of people living in the Niger-Delta region of Nigeria, and the role of multinational oil companies (MNOCs) divesting the proceeds of oil and gas to a national company that exhibits less responsibility and care towards the environment, which is a huge challenge.

## C. DAY TWO: SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS

### 3.1 Recap of Day One

Dr. Irekpiton Okukpon provided a recap of day one of the conference, stating the observations made by keynote speakers, the plenary session and presentations during the designated breakout sessions.

### 3.2 Plenary Sessions

#### 3.2.1 Plenary Session 2

Day 2 of the Conference commenced with Plenary Session 2 titled 'Financing Just Transitions'. The Session was chaired by Dr. Pedi Obani with Dr. Emomotimi Agama (Nigerian Capital Market Institute Subsidiary (Securities and Exchange Commission) and Mr. Joe Levin (Watson Farley and Williams), Tom Gray and Harsh Chawda as Panelists.

Dr. Agama discussed the import of having equitable and sustainable transformation of economics in the just transition debate, whilst Mr. Joe Levin discussed the importance of finance in the energy sector in Africa. Harsch Chawda contributed further to the session by sharing his experiences in financing just transition projects, noting that Africa is in dire need of the right legislative framework to fund these projects. Tom Gray emphasized that beyond obtaining finance to fund just transition projects lies the challenge of finding and developing such projects, and as such, collaboration with the government is a way of solving such a challenge.

#### Key Observations:

- Many individuals may not fully comprehend the concept of a just transition or its connection to financing.
- A just transition pertains to society's fair and sustainable shift towards a low-carbon future. It acknowledges the importance of addressing the social and environmental consequences when moving from fossil fuels to renewable energy sources.
- Transition financing and climate finance are not interchangeable terms. Climate finance specifically pertains to funding initiatives aimed at addressing climate change. It may not necessarily prioritize the goal of inclusivity or consider the impact of decarbonisation efforts on marginalised workers and communities.
- The Just Transition finance approach aims to merge green assets with favourable social outcomes while also considering the effects on affected workers and communities.

- The focus is not solely on climate finance action. The well-being of individuals is also of great importance, which is a separate matter from the climate finance agenda.
- This pertains to the social and economic endeavours that affect specific groups of individuals, the difficulties involved, and the concept of social discourse. This holds significance in the creation of job opportunities, ensuring high-quality jobs, facilitating access to affordable and clean energy through the promotion of low-carbon economic activities, opening up new markets, promoting economic diversity, enabling cost savings for consumers and businesses through increased energy and resource efficiency, and enhancing air quality and related health benefits.
- The discussion on climate action should focus on its impact on people, not just on concepts like erosion, desertification, and pollution. While these issues are essential, it is crucial to consider how climate action affects stakeholders directly or indirectly involved in the transition process. These stakeholders include workers, businesses, consumers, communities, and indigenous groups whose needs and perspectives should be considered. Ultimately, it is the people who matter the most.
- The concept of a just transition has two principal objectives: (i) to establish an economy that is both low-carbon and resilient to climate change, and (ii) to ensure that no one is excluded from this transition. Achieving these goals will require a financing strategy that takes both into account. However, financing such transitions is a complex task that demands creative and inclusive solutions to guarantee that no one is left behind.
- Africa still struggles with an energy deficiency; nearly half of Sub-Saharan Africa does not have access to affordable energy. Even those who do have access experience frequent power cuts.
- A just transition involves investing in and utilizing various energy sources such as oil and gas, renewables, and hydrogen. The main goal is to provide ample power to the continent while minimizing carbon emissions, thus giving people access to electricity with a low carbon footprint.
- Over the next few decades, there will be a shift towards renewable energy sources like wind, solar, and hydro and a decrease in the use of oil and gas. This will be a long-term transition.

- Lending into the African energy sector poses specific challenges.
- When dealing with international financing, loans must be funded using hard currency. However, if a project is set to receive payments in the local currency, it can be challenging due to its tendency to depreciate over time. This can make it difficult for governments to repay loans in hard currency or access financing

The global financial community acknowledges that gas is a crucial building block to the transition from non-renewable fossil fuels to sustainable energy sources.

- One of the biggest obstacles is identifying projects that fulfil the funding requirements of banks since numerous banks are willing to invest in Africa.
- In Africa, the current procurement process for projects is quite structured, resulting in lengthy timelines and highly competitive tariffs. This, in turn, limits the number of available projects that can be funded. There is a need for more flexibility to overcome this challenge and increase the number of projects that can be financed.

### 3.2.2 Plenary Session 3

Plenary Session 3 titled 'Extractive Sector, Just Transition and Human Rights' was chaired by Dr. Pedi Obani with Professor Damilola Olawuyi, SAN (Hamad Bin Khalifa University) as the key Speaker for the session. Professor Olawuyi stated the need to consider the fundamental human rights of the people in the implementation of just transition. He emphasized, inter alia, the issues with the extraction of nickel in the Philippines and Malaysia which led to violation of human rights, and as such, it is essential to place human rights at the centre of sustainable development efforts.

#### Key Observations:

- Research indicates that extracting certain transition minerals is exacerbating conflicts and even violating human rights in various areas of Africa. In response to these issues, the United Nations Security Council issued a resolution regarding the Democratic Republic of Congo, urging those involved in mineral extraction to prioritize human rights considerations.
- The extraction of nickel, a valuable transitional mineral, results in human rights violations in the Philippines and Indonesia.

- There is a concern that certain States may Collude with IOCs to ignore human rights violations to promote mineral sales.
- There is a complex web of advancing climate response to align with human rights response.
- To address unsustainable consumption patterns to the continued use of oil and gas, some countries have made the move to end fossil fuel subsidies. Nigeria is an example.
- It has been determined that there is no valid reason to maintain fuel subsidies. This considers that they no longer serve any environmental, economic, or social purpose. It is more beneficial to utilize those funds towards infrastructure development.
- The issue then relates to whether subsidy has been removed in a right-based manner. The reality is that there are still fuel queues, some communities are reverting to using firewood, and some communities can't afford basic amenities or the ability to commute to work or places of worship
- The subsidy removal should have been underpinned by long-term preparatory measures rather than knee-jerk reactions by announcing paltry grant schemes for families. The tendency to make such pronouncements without considering experts' views is a trend that will lead to human rights violations and policy collapse.
- Such unplanned removal of subsidies can lead to the collapse of several progressive steps the country has achieved in terms of human rights, energy and food security, as well as water security;
- There is a lack of coherence to transition to low-carbon energy sources.

### 3.2.2.1 Breakout Sessions

Breakout Session 6 commenced after the Plenary session with Dr. Cristina D'Alessandro chairing the session. Three presentations were made during the session by Erebi Ndoni (American University of Nigeria); Giorgia Pane (University of Palermo, Italy) and Josephine C. Ojiaka (Imo State University, Nigeria)

Dr. Ndoni's presentation titled 'Evaluating Just Transition to a Post-oil Future through a Gendered Lens' emphasized the intersections between sustainable development, gender questions and inclusiveness. The presentation examined the underrepresentation of women in the social construct and that greening the economy requires a consideration of women empowerment in decision making. Dr. Ndoni also



noted that in the fossil fuel economy, women are given fewer jobs and as such, just transition to sustainable development can be achieved when there is inclusivity on all fronts.

Presentations made by Giorgia Pane - 'Sustainable for whom? An Ecofeminist reading of Just Transition' and Josephine Ojiaka - 'Implementing a Just Transition from a Fossil-Fuel Economy to a Low-Carbon Economy from a Gender Perspective' further examined just transitions from a gendered perspective. Both presentations highlighted the need to protect the rights of women in implementing just transition strategies, including the need for accurate available data on just transitions in rural areas.

### 3.2.3 Plenary Session 4

Plenary Session 4 titled 'Governance and Environmental Justice' was chaired by Dr. Anna Zalik. Panelists at the session were Professor Olanrewaju Fagbohun, SAN (Environmental Law Research Institute); Professor Don Lloyd (University of Bradford); Dr. Cristina D'Alessandro (Insee, France) and Dr. Sameer Sharma (Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) to Chief Minister Andhra Pradesh, India).

Professor Fagbohun discussed the goals of governance which include environmental performance, sustainable development and environmental justice and ways in which these can be achieved. Professor Lloyd's presentation analysed the intersection of risk and environmental justice, noting that environmental governance is a right expected from a State and the responsibility of State(s) to deliver and devise strategies to tackle challenges of environmental governance. Dr Cristina D'Alessandro's presentation discussed the intricacies of environmental governance, describing it as 'a basket with tools which includes policy, rules, laws and governmental interaction with societies.' She noted three important pre-conditions that should encompass environmental justice ie dealing with multi-dimensional inequalities; 'good-fit' governance of natural resources; and tackling democratic developmental gaps Dr. Sharma also noted that eradicating extreme poverty and stopping climate change are very urgent global challenges which must be tackled together to achieve a just transition which protects the poorest and most vulnerable.

#### Key Observations:

- Improved environmental performance and sustainable development is the twin goal to achieving environmental justice
- There is a need for a reality check and in the face of poverty, environmental justice will be a mirage
- Sustainable development, global distribution of wealth is devoid of real justice and capitalism plays a significant role

- Global power politics monopoly of the few, Predominance of self-interest, Manipulation of laws, policies & institutions (soft laws) and Leadership deficit poses a challenge in achieving improved outcomes
- Universities should set the agenda and take the lead by deepening training on ethical leadership and behavioural changes and revisit the discussion that will reduce the ambiguity of the definition of critical concepts against the background of what we now know
- Universities think long term and we can amortise that advantage for improved results.
- Environmental governance is a basket with tools that includes policy, rules, laws, and government interaction with societies
- There is availability of data but no ownership of it because there is no knowledge of its existence.
- The needs of financing of environmental economies, are not being met.
- The emissions reductions needed to stop climate change have to be achieved through a just transition which protects the poorest and most vulnerable.
- Departments should set targets and intervention by identifying the programmatic activities that contribute to achievement of targets on the indicators
- Disaggregate targets at the VWS level as well as monitor at that level which leads to localisation of SDGs
- Eradicating extreme poverty and stopping climate change are two urgent global challenges and they can only be tackled together

### 3.2.3.1 Breakout Session

Breakout sessions continued immediately after Plenary 4, with Breakout session 7 consolidated into Breakout Session 8. Presenters for Breakout Session 8 were Professor Anna Mdee (University of Leeds), Dr. Eghosa Ekhaton (University of Derby) and Alessandra Guida (Queen's University, Belfast). The session was chaired by Dr. Irekpitan Okukpon.

Anna Mdee's presentation titled 'Fluffy Words and Good Intentions: The Problem with the SDGs, Communities and Justice in actually existing Governance of the Post-oil Future' emphasized how loosely the terms 'sustainable development goals' are used without a clear understanding of what they truly mean, the agendas they serve and the incentives they proffer. She interrogated what just transitions are for and how it can be 'just', the pervasive power of fluffy global rhetoric in place of specific analysis

of context and the need for academics/legal practitioners to avoid being complicit in using technical terms around just transitions but focus on real incentives and the flow of power.

Eghosa Ekhator's presentation titled 'Environmental Justice in the Global South: Overview of some Contemporary Developments' highlighted the problematic nature of defining the just transition concept. The presentation identified environmental justice developments to include linkages to the right to environment, conceptualization of climate justice among others, noting that environmental justice scholarship is now mainstream.

Alessandra Guida's presentation - 'Environmental Governance in the Technology Era: A Need for an Effective Approach and a Constructive Bridge of Knowledge' discussed the achievement of sustainable development which is dependent on governance that is proactive with stakeholder inclusion.

### **Key Observations:**

- President Biden's executive Order on revitalizing environmental justice expanded the definition of environmental justice.
- The US and the UK share same conception on environmental justice i.e. equity and participation.
- In Latin America, Environmental justice is based on the indigenous people's movements and their struggle.
- Environmental justice is linked to the right to environment.
- The Global South environmental justice scholarship is now mainstream.
- The African Union was the first international instrument to identify environmental rights as enforceable rights.
- There is an increasing number of environmental disasters.
- There is a rising challenge of education for a just and equitable future.
- The responsive approach to environmental governance ignores the fact that the ecosystem are inherently complex.

### **3.2.4 Panel Discussion on Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission Report**

Further activities for Day 2 of the Conference included a Panel Discussion on Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission Report titled 'Environmental Genocide: The Human and Environmental Cost of Big Oil in Bayelsa, Nigeria'.

The document is an investigative report which highlights the damage to the environment, lives and livelihoods of people in Bayelsa State, Nigeria and the need for accountability of international oil and gas companies (IOCs) for environmental damages.

The Panel was chaired by Professor Engobo Emeseh (University of Bradford) with the following panelists: Professor Michael Watts (University of California); Professor Engobo Emeseh (University of Bradford); Dr. Anna Zalik (York University, Canada); Dr. Kathryn Nwajiaku-Dahou (Overseas Development Institute, UK) and Dr. Isaac Asume Osuoka (Social Action International).

The panel session commenced with a video introducing the basis of the report, which captured interviews from indigenes of Bayelsa state, showing the devastating effect of oil pollution on the people, aquatic lives and the general wellbeing of the people of Bayelsa State. It was stated that the criminality in the Niger Delta is exacerbated by the Federal Government as a result of the oil in the state. **A copy of the Panel Discussion report is in the Appendix to this report.**

### 3.2.5 Poster Presentation

Immediately after the Panel Discussion on the Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission Report, the poster presentation/networking event took place. The poster presentation was made by three doctoral candidates of the School of Law, University of Bradford – Stephanie Diri (Transnational Litigation & Parent Company Liability? Oil Pollution and Environmental Degradation in Nigeria); Believe Edemadide (The Role of Social and Environmental Justice in Addressing Social Inequalities in Just Transition: Applying Business Policy Commitment and Due Diligence Standard) and Joana Kolo-Manma. (Torn in 2 Ds: diseased and displaced, where do I turn? Nigeria’s Niger-Delta Region as a case study’.

After the poster presentations, a further presentation was made by Ines Fernandes da Silva Araujo to introduce the World Bank Group Youth to Youth (Y2Y) Community to the participants at the Conference.

## D. DAY THREE: SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS

Dr. Irekpitan Okukpon provided a recap of Day Two of the Conference to the participants, including an overview of what Day 3 programme would consist of.

### 4.1 Plenary Sessions

#### 4.1.1 Plenary Session 5

Plenary 5 titled ‘Education for a Just and Equitable Post-oil Future’ was chaired by Professor Anna Mdee (University of Leeds) with Professor Akpezi Ogbuigwe (Adviser for the African Region, UNU/RCE’s) as Plenary Speaker. She discussed the need for stakeholders to rise to the challenge of education for a just and equitable transition, with a clear focus on legal education. Professor Ogbuigwe emphasized the need for lawyers to understand the scientific process of climate change, and the importance of embedding the concepts of climate change and legal education in university education to facilitate engagement of local concerns of impunity. This, she noted, raises the question: how do we decolonize knowledge in the university? She

further stressed, inter alia, that teaching, research and community service must be evident in education.

### **Key Observations:**

- The gravest effect of phasing out of fossil fuel will be borne by the least users like Africa.
- Africa is pushed to a system of development that does not meet its needs and put it on a level of dependency.
- There are a lot of opportunities that exist in just transition for the communities.
- NGOs should collaborate to promote environmental justice in various countries.
- Regional mechanisms should be implored to promote environmental justice.
- There should be more conceptualization of environmental justice needs by scholars in the Global South.
- Scale of legal evidence and scientific uncertainties should be adopted for the implementation of precautionary principle.
- There must be joint effort between stakeholder and experts.
- Everyone must take the lead to achieve environmental justice.
- There is the need to create circular economies and factor gender equity into any just transition and issue of financing.

## **4.2 Breakout Sessions**

The breakout sessions commenced immediately after the Plenary Sessions, with Breakout session 11 consolidated into Breakout Session 10. The breakout session was chaired by Dr. Eghosa Ekator (University of Derby) and consisted of three presentations. Kelechi Okengwu (University of Leeds); Rachel Parker (University of Leeds); and Helen Agu (University of Nigeria, Enugu Campus).

Kelechi Okengwu's presentation titled 'Potholes on the Road to a Just Transition: Power Dynamics Mistakes to avoid for a Post-oil Future in Nigeria' discussed the various potholes faced by the Nigerian government in implementing a sustainable just transition framework. Rachel Parker's presentation – 'Inequalities in the Production

and use of Cement and Concrete and their Consequences for Decarbonisation and Sustainable Development' examined inequalities in the work force/industry and impact on sustainable development with particular focus on cement and concrete industry which have initiatives for sustainability, particularly in decarbonization. Also, Helen Agu's presentation - 'Achieving Environmental Justice and Just Energy Transition in Nigeria: Challenges and Legal Safeguards discussed challenges faced by Nigeria in achieving a just transition, such as insecurity, attacks on energy facilities, lack of clarity in existing legal framework and regulatory uncertainties in the private sector.

Breakout session 12 was chaired by Ines Fernandes da Silva Araujo (Y2Y Community) with two presentations in the session: Hendrik Sander (Bauhaus University, Weimar, Germany); and Nneka Egbosionu (University of Nigeria, Nsukka).

Henrik Sander's presentation - 'Capitalist v just transitions in German coal Mining Regions: Best Practices and Perspectives of an Alternative Regional Development' examined federal laws in Germany related to the coal industry, examining the Rhineland Region and the Central German Regions. The paper discussed the position of the unions, distributive and procedural justice, lack of transparency in central Germany and the lack of recognition of workers and marginalized groups in the transition trajectory. The paper called for regional network for community supported by agriculture, formal school and village commons.

Nneka Egbosionu's paper - 'Leveraging External Innovation inside Evidence to attain Environmental Just Transition from the Nigerian wireless Telecommunication Industry: Case Study of MTN' focused on the global network provider MTN and the need for environmental justice. The presentation was not concluded due to technical glitches experienced by the presenter and paucity of time.

Breakout session 13 was chaired by Dr. Alessia Ofori (University of Cranfield) with presentations made by Linimose Anyiwe (University of Central Lancashire) and Nnennaya Jennifer Nwali (University of Aberdeen).

Linimose Anyiwe's paper - 'Climate Inequalities and the impact of a Low-Carbon Economy: Case Studies on Just Transition and Access to Environmental Justice in the UK' addressed difficulties faced by low income countries in mitigating greenhouse gas emissions, noting that the key element to making just transition work in any economy are regional and national collaboration. The paper also addressed the prevailing difficulty in understanding implementation of just transition, and the need for more education on implementation and inclusivity in the discourse.

Nnennaya Nwali's paper - 'Implementing a Just Transition Legal Framework for Nigeria's Post-oil Future: Recommendations derived from Scotland' highlighted the need for social impacts to be taken into consideration in just transitions framework, using strategies adopted by Scotland as the basis of the paper's analysis.



### 4.3 Distilling Outcomes

This part of the Conference sought to determine the outcomes from all presentations made at the Conference, to determine pathways and possible solutions for implementing just transitions for the global community. Discussions were moderated by Professor Anna Mdee with robust contributions from participants.

Some of the discussions during this session are presented below:

#### **Poser 1: What should markets do in terms of just transition and who is the market?**

- Just transitions should be attractive to markets in order to facilitate its implementation.
- Ideas that are considered radical should be deeply considered if we are serious about truly implementing just transitions.
- Necessity of authoritarian government to make the difficult decisions on what markets and states should do (an uncomfortable discussion but necessary if any progress is to be achieved for just transitions)
- Discussions surrounding authoritarianism and solidarity in driving just transition. Can it truly be described as authoritarianism or solidarity?

#### **Poser 2: Considering that there are lots of policies on paper, how then does action begin within agencies? How do we move past just policies on papers? What do we do about this regulatory gap?**

- Mining in Ghana lacks commitment and lack of capacity (regarded as a major impediment in African countries). The policies are there but there is lack of proper planning and implementation and the capacity to implement just transition.
- African countries should work on their capacity to implement just transition and improve capacity of governments in financing just transition.

#### **Poser 3: Is financing the key to just transition and the ingredient that changes capacity?**

- Financing is key and of utmost importance and an important element in moving just transition.
- Money matters, but the decisions made regarding financing is also very valuable.
- It is not always a question of financing but a question on what is equitable, just, and of importance.

- Financing of just transition should be examined beyond the nation state. A lot of challenges have been highlighted within the nation state. But critical to just transition is the role of developed countries and their commitment to the concept.
- Mindset of governmental bodies remains an issue due to corruption and lack of transparency in the African Context, which impedes implementation of just transition.
- Where are we transitioning from? It is important to know where we were before, in order to know where we are transitioning to.

#### **4.4 Conference Closing: Plenary Report Back and Communique**

Professor Engobo Emeseh gave a short speech on the purpose of the Conference, what the Conference achieved and a summary of the outcomes from the Conference. She expressed her appreciation to the Keynote Speakers, Plenary Session Speakers and Discussants, participants, Rapporteurs and School of Law, University of Bradford Conference Organising Committee.

Thereafter, Dr. Irekpitan Okukpon presented the Conference Communique to the audience. The Communique contained a short summary of key observations and recommendations made during the Conference. A copy of same is attached in Section 5.0 of this report.

Professor Emeseh, with the assistance of Dr. Ovo Imoedemhe (University of Bradford), presented Certificates of Attendance to in-person participants, while assuring online participants that their certificates of attendance would be emailed to them.

The Conference came to an end at 5.00pm.

#### **5.0 Seminar Communique**

The following observations and recommendations were made at the Conference:

##### **Observations**

- A just transition acknowledges the importance of addressing the social and environmental consequences when moving from fossil fuels to renewable energy sources.
- The key concept of just transition should be people inclusive. This involves reducing carbon emission while also centred around the people. These include the people's welfare, and the people's ability to access consistent and affordable energy.

- The Just Transition finance approach aims to merge green assets with favorable social outcomes while also considering the effects on affected workers and communities.
- Financial barriers can lead to a lack of affordable renewable and clean energy.
- The burden of mitigating and adapting to climate change is not shared equitably, and vulnerable communities are at the brunt of environmental injustice and are disproportionately affected.
- There is a lack of coherence to transition to low-carbon energy sources.
- Inadequate infrastructure is a challenge to adopting the requisite technology of renewable energy adoption.
- Without human rights, one cannot achieve sustainable development. Human rights should be made the basis of every transition.
- The gravest effect of phasing out of fossil fuel will be borne by the least users like Africa.
- Africa is pushed to a system of development that does not meet its needs and put it on a level of dependency.
- The history of the oil and gas sector goes beyond oil spills but includes gas flaring, dredging, destruction of mangroves and the unhealthy consequences of the oil and gas industry.
- There are a lot of opportunities that exist in just transition for the communities.
- There is a rising challenge of education for a just and equitable future.
- There should be more conceptualization of environmental justice needs by scholars in the Global South.
- Education must address local concerns of impunity and good governance.
- As practitioners, it is a solemn duty to emphasise the responsibility of States, business enterprises, and other stakeholders to ensure coherence in low-carbon measures while placing human rights at the centre of such efforts. This requires capacity development to ensure human rights principles drive sustainable growth.

- There is an inclusivity gap when discussing just transition from a gendered perspective which needs to be breached.
- Nigeria's energy infrastructure faces security challenges, as the risk of vandalism on energy facilities deters investors and will be an obstacle to the reliable operation of renewable energy projects.
- Mining in Ghana lacks commitment and lack of capacity, with a lack of proper planning and implementation and the capacity to implement.
- There is an environmental crisis in Bayelsa State, Nigeria which affects the lives of the people, impacts waterways, farming activities and aquatic lives.
- The scale of oil spillage in Nigeria between 2014-2020, averaging 230 spills per year are due to operational and maintenance failures of international oil companies (IOCs)
- Environmental justice is linked to inequality. Therefore, inequitable access to natural resources such as clean air, water, and agro-species remains an equivalent problem in contemporary society.
- Even though Environmental Justice is to be based on a proactive approach, the trend is increasingly focused on a responsive rather than a proactive approach to prevent.

### **Recommendations**

- A transition programme should be 'just' and not aggravate existing injustices
- Need for energy transition and a climate-neutral economy to be fair and inclusive that will create decent working opportunities that uphold the rights of indigenous peoples in affected communities through social dialogue and stakeholder engagement.
- Utilising international financial institutions and issue sovereign bonds that allocate funds specifically towards just transition priorities. Additionally, establishing dedicated national just transitional funds would be beneficial.
- The government should have the ability to attract additional private funding and create essential blended finance options
- Human rights must be placed at the centre of the transition effort.

- Scholars and Legal Practitioners have a solemn duty to point out the responsibility of states and business enterprise to place human rights at the heart of sustainable development efforts.
- There is a need to strength human rights organisations in other to properly advance just transition.
- There should be diversification of energy sources by reducing heavy reliance on fossil fuels and investing in renewable energy technologies
- Incorporation of African ethics in environmental justice in the global south.
- There is the need for the creation of holistic policies that will reflect greater accountability which carries the people along, and a proper implementation of these policies.
- Establishment of an international organization/corporation which encourages transparency when dealing with these transitioning minerals.
- There is a need for corporations to act as agent of energy justice to provide energy access and improve the economy as well as develop communities in order to resolve poverty challenges.
- Corporation to promote distributive energy justice rather than just social amenities.
- There is the need to create circular economies and factor gender equity into any just transition and issue of financing.
- Need for international solidarity in dismantling the demand side of natural resource theft
- There should be a development of theoretical knowledge on environmental justice and issues in the global south with non-academics as this is an area that involves all.
- NGOs should collaborate to promote environmental justice in various countries.
- Regional mechanisms should be implored to promote environmental justice.
- There is a need for community engagement and capacity building in preparation for the transition by taking impacted communities on board.

- Distributive and participatory environmental justice to apply to all irrespective of socio-economic status.
- There is a strong need for energy transition and a climate-neutral economy to be fair and inclusive, that will create decent working opportunities, and uphold the rights of indigenous peoples in affected communities through social dialogue and stakeholder engagement.
- At national levels, public authorities must provide access to environmental information, including hazardous items, decisions and community activities and allow citizens to participate in environmental management.

## **APPENDIX**

Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission Report 2023



## APPENDIX

## REPORT

**Panel Discussion on Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission Report***'Environmental Genocide: The Human and Environmental Cost of Big Oil in Bayelsa, Nigeria'***Chair:**

Professor Engobo Emeseh (Head, School of Law, University of Bradford)

**Panelists:**

Professor Michael Watts (University of California)

Professor Engobo Emeseh (University of Bradford)

Dr. Anna Zalik (York University, Canada)

Dr. Kathryn Nwajiaku-Dahou (Overseas Development Institute, UK)

Dr. Isaac Asume Osuoka (Social Action International).

**Introduction**

The panel commenced with a YouTube video introducing the report which captured interviews from indigenes of Bayelsa state, showing the devastating effect of oil pollution on the people, aquatic lives and the general wellbeing of the people of Bayelsa State. It was stated that the criminality in the Niger Delta is exacerbated by the Federal Government as a result of oil pollution in the state.

Discussions by Panelists during the session are summarised below.

**a. Dr. Kathryn Nwajiaku-Dahou- Overseas Development Institute (ODI) UK**

Dr Nwajiaku-Dahou noted that over the last four years, the team of Panelists worked tirelessly to ensure this report comes to light. She stated that ecocide plagues Bayelsa state today, and as such, the untold damage in Bayelsa is enormous as a result of more than 60 years of oil exploration in the region. Therefore, there is the need to provide a remedy for Bayelsa people as there is an environmental crisis in Bayelsa State. This affects the lives of the people, impacts waterways, farming activities and aquatic lives. The essence of the review report is to bring about recommendations on how to end pollution in Bayelsa state.

**b. Professor Michael Watts (University of California)**

Professor Watts discussed the data and evidence collected as part of investigations conducted by the Commission, and which are vital for questions of law and litigation.

Most of the crucial issues raised in the report are related to the data used which involved existing secondary work but also the commissioned research.

He noted the epistemological challenges in working in and around the oil and gas industry because it is an industry that claims to be high-tech and is surrounded by either secrecy or wildly contradictory evidence, and this needs to be confronted. In the case of the Niger Delta, evidence gathered is usually contradictory between IOCS, the government and community activists. Therefore, there was a need to review the structure of this knowledge production. This entails questions of who is producing it and for what purposes. What faith and confidence do we have in this data? This is essential to be able to establish the types of claims in the report.

Investigations for the report required sifting through a massive body of existing data, some by scholars, advocacy groups, legal cases etc. It was also crucial to commission forensic research that examined the toxic consequences and health consequences of the oil and gas industry.

He cited the example of the tobacco industry experience to drive home the point of the significance of robust evidence and data in a pressing environmental issue of this nature

**c. Dr. Anna Zalik (York University, Canada)**

Dr Zalik noted the need for reparation and full cost accounting which may diminish the profit received from the industry. There is corruption in the global north and south, subsidy and regulators work hand in hand with the companies. Therefore, cost accounting is important.

**d. Dr. Isaac Asume Osuoka (Social Action International)**

Dr. Osuoka spoke on implications of the report on just transitions in Bayelsa State. He discussed how the findings of this report address the demand of just transition and environmental justice, stating that there is need for mitigation through decarbonisation examining its implications. He addressed the issue of contract staff accounting for 90 percent of workers in the industry in Nigeria, including lack of access to benefits, which is akin to slave wages.

A legislative member of the House of Representatives, National Assembly, Nigeria representing Bayelsa State contributed to the Panel Discussion, with an undertaking that the Report would be brought to the attention of the legislature to ensure implementation of the recommendations by the government.

**Key Observations:**

- The history of the oil and gas sector goes beyond oil spills but includes gas flaring, dredging, destruction of mangroves and the unhealthy consequences of the oil and gas industry.

- The data reflects a horrifying analysis of the human and environmental impacts of the IOCs in the Niger Delta.
- The scale of oil spills in the Niger Delta, as indicated in the data, shows that for over 14 years, from 2006 – 2020, there were 3500 oil spills., which comes to 230 yearly spills. By comparison, in the whole of Western Europe, there were 25 spills recorded per year. Western Europe is 500 times larger than Bayelsa State.
- The intensity of the spills i.e. the number of falls per length of the pipeline, is 500 times greater than comparable statistics. For instance, in the EU and North America;
- NOSDRA estimates that 88% of oil spills were due to sabotage. However, this report is viewed with skepticism, considering that other research shows that it was, in fact, operational and maintenance failures that accounted for 80% of the spills. Oil companies can escape any liability if such attributions are placed on sabotage.
- The data provided by NOSDRA is deeply suspect as a study of 6000 joint investigations visits supplied that 80% had no estimation of the spill area, 70% had no description of the nature of the spill, and over one-third had no analysis of the quantity of the oil spill.
- After an oil spill, there should be a remediation process. This only happened in 3% of all spill sites. A joint investigation committee has to meet within 24 hours of a spill. For instance, Shell's average time for attending to a spill was seven days and, in the worst case, would extend up to one year or more. These are failures of prevention, response and remediation.
- Concerning infrastructure, 40 % of the pipelines are over 30 years old. With this antiquity of infrastructure, there will always be a likelihood of these failures.
- The existence of polyaromatic hydrocarbon, a toxic content in the water of petroleum products, in all sites exceeded by a minimum of three hundred times the maximum target level. The human tissue samples collected show an extraordinarily high rate of lead and chromium in human tissues.
- There are illegal artisanal refineries.

- There can be no universal transition for just energy. Therefore, there is need for environmental justice broadly.
- Niger Delta played a significant role to anti hegemonic Environmental Justice discourse. For example, the struggle of the Ogoni people brought about the Ogoni Bill of Right and the Kaiama declaration by the Ijaw Youth Council. These struggles contributed to Environmental Justice, expressed through shell boycott in the 90s. However, the demands of the Ogoni struggle where not appropriated to the western Environmental Justice.
- The Ogoni struggle led to Resource Control in the Niger Delta, but outside the region, there is no understanding of resource control. Resource control simply means community sovereignty over culture, cultural heritages, control of resources etc. To meet these demands, there is need for restructure and recognition of the indigenous peoples existing realities.

### **Findings:**

- There was contradictory evidence by the government, scholars, IOCs, community and activists, thereby leading to questions on confidence of data as this may affect the claims made in the data. Therefore, the issue of data is crucial.
- The issue of gas flaring, destruction of mangroves, among others, have health implications.
- Looking at the scale of oil spillage in Nigeria between 2014-2020, there were 230 spills per year compared to 25 in the entire Europe. It was found that most of these spills are as a result of operational and maintenance failures, which facilitates the ability of IOCs to escape responsibilities.
- Environmental remediation is low with problems such as nature of infrastructure which are outdate i.e. over 30 years old. This could be a contributory factor.

### **Recommendations**

The Report has ten core recommendations, such as revamping the legal framework, as review of the Petroleum Industry Act 2021 shows that it will result in worst environmental outcomes. The Panel discussion proffered the following recommendations as part of efforts for implementation of just transitions in Nigeria:

- The UK and Italy are home to multinational oil corporations - Shell and Eni respectively. Hence, the UK and Italy should be morally and ethically responsible by, for example, implementing Anti Model Slavery Legislation to ensure that corporations domiciled in the UK are held responsible for activities of their corporations domiciled abroad.
- Bayelsa State Lives matter. There is need for justice e.g. polluter-pays principle. Victims should not be allowed to prove oil companies negligence on pollution before they can get justice
- There is the need for a joint investigation visit to determine how data was gotten.
- ADR mechanism can be adopted for settlement of disputes
- There is the need for improved health data – human health is in danger, leading to environmental genocide.
- The time is now for environmental justice and just transition to make Bayelsa state lives better.
- The Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission (the ‘Commission’) calls on international oil companies (IOCs) in Bayelsa State, Nigeria, and home countries of oil companies to take responsibility - individually and collectively - to solve this problem.
- Advocating strongly for recovery of Bayelsa will include clean-ups, health monitoring, and redress of the systemic pollution which have consequences on the health of Bayelsa people.
- Facilitate a transition from oil and gas to renewables.
- IOCs - Shell and Eni must admit to a share of the responsibility for environmental degradation in Bayelsa State. This includes paying their share of 12 billion dollars over the next 12 years to account for the damages done.
- Need to strengthen government responsibility, revamp role of the state and Local governments.
- Ensure accountability- corporate accountability based on laws that can be enforced.

Bayelsa State Oil and Gas Commission Report 2023 - Full Report available here: <https://report.bayelsacommission.org/>